MECHANISMS IN ENDOCRINOLOGY

Neurodevelopmental disorders in children born to mothers with thyroid dysfunction: evidence of fetal programming?

Stine Linding Andersen¹,², Allan Carlé¹, Jesper Karmisholt¹, Inge Bülow Pedersen¹ and Stig Andersen³,⁴

Departments of ¹Endocrinology, ²Clinical Biochemistry, and ³Geriatrics, Aalborg University Hospital, Aalborg, Denmark, and ⁴Department Clinical Medicine, Aalborg University, Aalborg, Denmark

Abstract

Fetal programming is a long-standing, but still evolving, concept that links exposures during pregnancy to the later development of disease in the offspring. A fetal programming effect has been considered within different endocrine axes and in relation to different maternal endocrine diseases. In this critical review, we describe and discuss the hypothesis of fetal programming by maternal thyroid dysfunction in the context of fetal brain development and neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring. Thyroid hormones are important regulators of early brain development, and evidence from experimental and observational human studies have demonstrated structural and functional abnormalities in the brain caused by the lack or excess of thyroid hormone during fetal brain development. The hypothesis that such abnormalities introduced during early fetal brain development increase susceptibility for the later onset of neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring is biologically plausible. However, epidemiological studies on the association between maternal thyroid dysfunction and long-term child outcomes are observational in design, and are challenged by important methodological aspects.

Introduction

Thyroid hormones are important developmental factors and crucial during early brain development (1). Development of the human brain is a tightly regulated and complex process that extends beyond the pregnancy period (2). It is genetically encoded and prone to disturbances by prenatal and postnatal exposures. Evidence from in vitro and in vivo studies have demonstrated the important role of thyroid hormones in brain development. In cerebellar cell cultures, dendritic growth of Purkinje cells was significant in the presence...
of T3 or T4, but not in the absence of thyroid hormones (3, 4). In rats, studies have demonstrated the structural and functional consequences of maternal thyroid dysfunction on the fetal brain including alterations in the neuronal proliferation, migration, differentiation, synaptogenesis and myelination (1, 2, 5).

In humans, the most severe and adverse effect of maternal hypothyroidism on fetal brain development is evident from the neurological symptoms of endemic cretinism (6). Recent studies including data on brain MRI scans from children born to mothers with thyroid dysfunction have demonstrated structural defects in the brain (7, 8, 9, 10, 11). However, most studies in humans include indicators of exposure or outcome and are observational in design, which may challenge the interpretation of the results.

Neurodevelopmental disorders develop secondary to disruption of early brain development (12). Depending on the cause and timing of exposure, the symptoms of neurodevelopmental disorders may vary and may range from specific disabilities to global impairments. The causes are far from understood, and the diseases are generally considered of multifactorial origin (13). A proposed mechanism is ‘the fetal origin hypothesis’ that links exposures during fetal life with the later development of disease (14). Considering the crucial role of maternal thyroid hormones during early brain development, a pertinent question is whether abnormal maternal thyroid function in pregnancy via subtle changes during early brain development can program the fetus to neurodevelopmental disease.

In this critical review, we describe the concept of fetal programming and the hypothesis of fetal programming by maternal thyroid dysfunction. We discuss the evidence of this hypothesis in relation to brain development and neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring and address the methodological challenges.

**Fetal origin hypothesis**

The first description of a possible fetal programming effect emerged from Norway and was published in 1977 (15). In this study, Forsdahl showed that cardiovascular mortality in men aged 40–69 years was higher if they had been born in regions where infant mortality at that time was high. He believed that this was due to poor living conditions. The study by Barker et al. showed that the link was birth weight and proposed the fetal origin hypothesis in 1989 (16). They showed that men with the lowest birth weight and weight at 1 year of age had the highest mortality rate due to ischemic heart disease and a higher frequency of impaired glucose tolerance at the age of 60–70 years (16). These findings led to the suggestion of ‘the thrifty phenotype hypothesis’ for the development of type 2 diabetes (17). Adaptation to poor nutrition in fetal life may lead to permanent changes in the function of organs, which would be beneficial if nutrition remained poor after birth. However, if nutrition becomes plentiful later, the adaptive changes may predispose to development of disease in obese individuals. This interaction between prenatal and postnatal exposure has also been shown in study periods with extreme shortage of food e.g. exposure to the Dutch (18) and Chinese famine (19) in fetal life was associated with a higher risk of type 2 diabetes in adulthood. This association was exacerbated by high socioeconomic status, BMI and western dietary pattern. About the time of ‘the thrifty phenotype hypothesis’, a programing effect on the later development of other diseases was proposed. The study by Ekbom et al. (20) from Sweden published in the year 1992 showed that high birth weight was a risk factor and that maternal preeclampsia was a protective factor for later development of breast cancer. The concept of fetal programing has been extensively studied during the following decades, and fetal programing has been considered within many different endocrine axes (Table 1). The field is intriguing and complex because endocrine diseases can be considered as the exposure during the pregnancy, but also as the outcome in the offspring. Diabetes is the most common endocrine disease, and the concept of fetal programing has long been considered in relation to this disease (21, 22). As mentioned above, some of the initial studies within this field observed a link between exposures in pregnancy and later development of impaired glucose tolerance or diabetes in the offspring. In contrast, the programing effect of maternal diabetes in the pregnancy on later development of disease in the offspring has been considered, and the main mechanism proposed has been via maternal blood glucose levels (21, 22).

Another endocrine axis much considered in the concept of fetal programing is the hypothalamus–pituitary–adrenal axis (HPA-axis) in relation to maternal stress and cortisol excess in pregnancy (23, 24). Evidence suggests that exposure to high levels of cortisol in utero may alter the set-point of the fetal HPA-axis (23). This may lead to higher cortisol levels in the offspring that may even persist into adult life, and the subtle variation in the HPA-axis activity has been linked to the later...
development of cardio-metabolic disorders and brain disorders (23).

Table 1 List of endocrine axes and peripheral hormones in which fetal programing has been considered including possible clinical ‘clues’ and maternal ‘conditions’.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Endocrine axis</th>
<th>Peripheral hormones</th>
<th>Clinical ‘clues’</th>
<th>Maternal ‘condition’</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HPT-axis (hypothalamus–pituitary–thyroid)</td>
<td>Thyroid hormones (T4 and T3)</td>
<td>Hyper- or hypothyroidism?</td>
<td>Thyroid disorders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPA-axis (hypothalamus–pituitary–adrenal)</td>
<td>Cortisol</td>
<td>Thyroid autoantibodies?</td>
<td>Cushing’s disease</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HPG-axis (hypothalamus–pituitary–gonadal)</td>
<td>Epinephrine, norepinephrine, dopamine, Aldosterone</td>
<td>Catecholamine excess?</td>
<td>Pheochromocytoma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GH-IGF-1 axis (hypothalamus–pituitary–liver)</td>
<td>Testosterone</td>
<td>Hyperaldosteronism?</td>
<td>Conn’s syndrome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oxytocin/vasopressin-axis (hypothalamus–pituitary)</td>
<td>Prolactin, Oxytocin</td>
<td>Growth hormone excess?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTH-axis (parathyroid gland)</td>
<td>Parathyroid hormone (PTH)</td>
<td>Hyperprolactinemia?</td>
<td>Acromegaly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insulin–glucagon-axis (pancreas)</td>
<td>Insulin</td>
<td>Oxytocin excess?</td>
<td>Prolactinoma</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Glucagon</td>
<td>Vasopressin deficiency/excess?</td>
<td>Exogenous</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Hyper- or hypoparathyroidism?</td>
<td>Diabetes insipidus/ SIADH&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup>Syndrome of inappropriate antidiuretic hormone secretion.

HYPOTHESIS OF FETAL PROGRAMING BY MATERNAL THYROID DYSFUNCTION

Considering fetal programing in relation to the hypothalamus-pituitary-thyroid axis (Table 1), this association is similarly complex. Thyroid hormone abnormalities and thyroid autoimmunity have been considered both as the outcome and as the exposure in a fetal programing hypothesis. A number of studies, including studies in twins, have evaluated the association between birth weight and adult thyroid function as the outcome, and some studies have reported an association between fetal growth characteristics and the later presence of thyroid autoantibodies and adult thyroid function (25, 26), whereas others found no association (27, 28, 29).

Recent studies in experimental animals (30) and in humans (31, 32, 33) have considered thyroid hormone abnormalities as the exposure and cardiovascular function as the outcome. A study in rats (30) suggested that maternal thyroid hormone levels are important in the development of hypothalamic neurons regulating cardiovascular functions. Studies in humans have shown that maternal hypothyroidism may be associated with congenital heart defects in the offspring (32), and that maternal thyroid function in pregnancy may program offspring blood pressure at the age of 20 (33). Still, another study found no association with offspring blood pressure at the age of 6 years (31).

How the lack or excess of thyroid hormone during a pregnancy may influence the fetal development, particularly the fetal brain development, has been studied for decades (1). The fetal thyroid gland is increasingly able to synthesize thyroid hormones in the second half of the pregnancy, and maternal thyroid hormones are critical in the maintenance of a normal pregnancy and in the fetal development, both in the early pregnancy and after the onset of fetal thyroid hormone production (34, 35). Thus, the hypothesis of fetal programing by maternal thyroid dysfunction via the role of thyroid hormones in the fetal brain development appears biologically plausible (Fig. 1). The hypothesis is that subtle changes during early brain development may program the fetus to later development of neurodevelopmental disease, and a pertinent consideration is whether the brain abnormalities described after in utero exposure to maternal thyroid dysfunction may coincide with the abnormalities described in neurodevelopmental disorders. However, the association is intriguing due to the multifactorial etiology of both thyroid disorders and neurodevelopmental disorders, and whereas the experimental evidence may be strong, the evaluation of results from observational
studies may be challenged by a long line of many other prenatal and postnatal factors (Fig. 1).

**Thyroid hormones and brain development**

Brain development is a complex process that is genetically determined, but also sensitive to the maternal environment. Development of the brain occurs in a series of stages that start in early fetal life and continues after birth (2). A key characteristic of the brain is that it continues to develop and that the development is plastic. Brain plasticity is the concept that the human brain is able to modify its structure and function in response to the postnatal environment (36). Comprehensive evidence from both in vitro studies of cell cultures and in vivo studies have demonstrated the structural and functional consequences of alterations in the supply of thyroid hormone to the fetal brain during the early developmental period. Structural defects include abnormalities in cell proliferation, migration, differentiation, synaptogenesis and myelination, whereas many of the functional abnormalities relate to alterations in the neurochemical environment in the brain (1, 2, 5).

Brain development is a highly regulated process and an important part of this regulation includes the coordinated and timely expression of many different genes. Thyroid hormones are important developmental factors and their crucial role in early brain development is facilitated via the regulation of gene expression (37). T3 binds to nuclear thyroid hormone receptors, and recent in vitro studies have identified genes of primary cerebrocortical cells that are regulated transcriptionally by T3 (38, 39).

One of the oldest observations in humans on the adverse effects of abnormal maternal thyroid function in pregnancy on fetal brain development is the neurological symptoms of cretinism (6). Endemic cretinism is a disorder of profound mental and physical disability that develops as a consequence of severe iodine deficiency (6). Distinct clinical types of the disorder have been described and it has been proposed that the two clinical types emerge from different pathophysiological episodes during the early development (40). Thus, neurological cretinism with irreversible neurological deficits has been interpreted as a consequence of maternal and fetal hypothyroidism during the pregnancy, whereas the symptoms of myxedematous cretinism are considered related to the duration and severity of postnatal hypothyroidism (40).

The structural and functional consequences of maternal thyroid dysfunction on the fetal brain development in humans have mainly been studied from indicators of altered brain development e.g. from neuropsychological testing of the children, from parent
Maternal thyroid dysfunction and offspring neurodevelopmental disorders

The linkage between the brain abnormalities described after in utero exposure to maternal thyroid dysfunction and the abnormalities described in neurodevelopmental disorders will be exemplified below by seizure disorders and attention deficit hyperactivity disorder (ADHD).

The neurodevelopmental abnormalities described in seizure disorders include among other malformations of cortical development. These malformations are macro- or microscopic abnormalities of the cerebral cortex that may result from abnormal proliferation, migration or synaptogenesis (41). Furthermore, alterations of the hippocampus have been considered a potential focus for the development of different types of seizure (42). Evidence from studies in animals support the hypothesis that maternal hypothyroidism in pregnancy may program the offspring to later development of seizure. In a study of rats (43), offspring exposed to maternal hypothyroidism during the pregnancy (induced by Methimazole) had an altered organization of the neocortex with abnormal migration and cytoarchitecture in the somatosensory cortex and in hippocampus. In addition to this, offspring exposed to maternal hypothyroidism in pregnancy were more likely to respond with seizure to an acoustic stimulus than the non-exposed (normal) rats; in another study, increasing dose of Propylthiouracil administered to pregnant rats was associated with longer duration of clonic seizures in the rat offspring (44).

Neurodevelopmental abnormalities associated with ADHD include structural alterations in the basal ganglia and in cortical thickness in frontal and parietotemporal regions and functional alterations within dopaminergic, noradrenergic and serotonergic neurotransmission (13, 45). Evidence from studies in animals and in humans support the hypothesis that maternal hyperthyroidism in pregnancy may program the offspring to later development of ADHD. In a recent experimental study (46), the effect of hyperthyroidism in the brain on behavior and hyperactivity was examined in a mouse model of type 3 deiodinase (DIO3) deficiency. DIO3 inactivates thyroid hormones and is highly expressed in the brain. Mice with DIO3 deficiency had high T3 levels in the brain, and responded with hyperactivity as well as decreased anxiety and depression-like behavior (46). In humans, ADHD symptoms have been strongly associated with generalized resistance to thyroid hormone caused by a mutation in the thyroid-receptor β gene. In a study (47) of 18 families with a history of generalized resistance to thyroid hormone, affected and unaffected family members (children and adults) were evaluated by structured questionnaires for the presence of ADHD symptoms. Among adults and children, ADHD symptoms were much more frequent in individuals with generalized resistance to thyroid hormone than that in unaffected individuals. The thyroid receptor α (TRα) is the predominant receptor in the brain (48). TRα is exposed to high levels of thyroid hormone in patients with generalized resistance to thyroid hormone.

In Danish population-based studies (49, 50), we evaluated the hypothesis of fetal programming by maternal hypo- and hyperthyroidism (Fig. 2). We studied nearly 1.7 million children born in Denmark and followed them to the age of 30 years for the development of seizure (neonatal seizure, febrile seizure or epilepsy) and we studied nearly 850000 children born in Denmark and followed them to the age of 18 years for the diagnosis of ADHD. Notably, children born to mothers who were first time diagnosed and treated for thyroid disease in the years after the pregnancy had an increased risk of developing the neurodevelopmental disorders under study. It can be speculated if these women already suffered from some degree of thyroid dysfunction in the pregnancy, which at that point was undiagnosed and untreated. However, only indicators of exposure in pregnancy were available and more studies in humans, including studies with actual measurement of thyroid function in pregnancy, are needed to evaluate the association between maternal thyroid dysfunction...
and neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring. In the Danish study, no increased risk of ADHD was observed in children born to mothers with hypothyroidism, but other observational studies have reported associations with maternal high thyroid-stimulating hormone (TSH) (51, 52), hypothyroxinemia (53), iodine deficiency (54) and the presence of thyroid peroxidase antibodies (55) illustrating the complexity of this association in an observational design, as discussed below.

### Methodological considerations

All studies in humans evaluating the association between maternal thyroid dysfunction in pregnancy and specific neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring were observational in design. Randomized controlled trials (RCTs) have been conducted with child IQ (56, 57) or pregnancy and perinatal complications (58) as outcomes. There are, however, ethical issues in the performance of RCTs in pregnant women as some testing may be considered unethical. This emphasizes the need for studies of different design.

Observational studies is an option that is typically cheaper and faster than RCTs, and it may seem as the ethically proper way of studying a specific research question. However, observational studies may reveal associations that should be interpreted carefully for the evaluation of causality (59) due to the various possible reasons (bias, confounding, chance) for an association observed (60).

Bias means that a measure of association is systematically wrong (60). Figure 3 illustrates the hypothesis of fetal programming by maternal thyroid dysfunction from a methodological point of view. Selection bias may arise from the composition of the study population at the exposure level if exposed and non-exposed participants differ systematically in a way that is related to the outcome. In studies of individuals with thyroid disease, such bias may arise if the patients included are selected in a hospital setting and the propensity of referral to hospital differ by age or by the severity of the disease (61, 62). Information bias has to do with the study definition of exposure and outcome (Fig. 3). For maternal thyroid disease, the timing of exposure in pregnancy and the timing of treatment may play a role as well as the reference ranges used for classification of maternal thyroid dysfunction. Recently, we showed that the reference range for TSH in early pregnancy varied widely (63) and in line with other studies (64, 65, 66), we observed a high TSH in the very early pregnancy weeks. If method- and pregnancy-week specific reference ranges are not applied, this may introduce bias. For the outcome of neurodevelopmental disorders, the frequency of the disorders differs by age group, and the age of the child...
Confounding can arise when an extraneous factor is related to the exposure and to the outcome, and is not an intermediate between the exposure and the outcome (Fig. 3). Since the etiology of both maternal thyroid disease and neurodevelopmental disorders is considered multifactorial, observational studies are prone to confounding. One possible confounder is maternal smoking in pregnancy (Fig. 3). Smoking has been associated with an increased risk of hyperthyroidism and may protect against the development of hypothyroidism (68). Furthermore, maternal smoking in pregnancy has been considered a risk factor for neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring (13). Other possible environmental factors include the group of endocrine disrupting chemicals e.g. persistent organic pollutants and flame retardants (Fig. 3). Such chemicals may interfere with thyroid function (69), and they have also been considered risk factors for neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring (70). Finally, psychiatric disease in the parents may introduce confounding (Fig. 3). Psychiatric disease and thyroid disease may coincide (71), and parental psychiatric disease may also associate with the development of disease in the offspring (72).

Intermediate factors are on the causal pathway from the exposure to the outcome (Fig. 3). Maternal thyroid dysfunction is associated with pregnancy complications including an increased risk of preterm birth and deviations in birth weight (73). Thus, it can be speculated if an increased risk of neurodevelopmental disorders in children born to mothers with thyroid dysfunction is mediated via pregnancy complications. Another area of debate is the distinction between abnormal maternal thyroid hormone levels in pregnancy and thyroid autoimmunity per se. Thyroid autoimmunity can be considered the main exposure, an intermediate, or both. The mechanisms by which thyroid autoantibodies may complicate a pregnancy (e.g. direct toxic effect, genetic autoimmune predisposition, higher TSH) are still controversial (74). One way to address the potential role of genetics in observational studies is to study the association with exposure to paternal disease. In Danish population-based studies (49, 50, 71), we found no association between paternal thyroid dysfunction and neurodevelopmental disorders in the offspring, which may contradict a genetic component to some extent. The diversity in time of maternal onset of disease (Fig. 2) may also suggest that a consistently present genetic factor was not the main mechanism involved.

**Perspectives**

The molecular mechanisms for an *in utero* programming effect of different maternal conditions are still poorly understood. Focus has been on the role of epigenetic determinants (75). Thyroid hormones exert their crucial role during the fetal brain development via the regulation of gene expression (37), which indicates that epigenetic mechanisms may also be involved in fetal programming via maternal thyroid dysfunction.

The hypothesis of fetal programming by maternal thyroid dysfunction via disturbed early fetal brain development and later onset of neurodevelopmental disorders appears biologically plausible, which was one of the well-known viewpoints of Sir Bradford Hill in the evaluation of a causal relationship (59). Results from...
experimental studies have demonstrated developmental structural and/or functional defects after exposure to maternal thyroid dysfunction in pregnancy that may overlap with the developmental abnormalities described in neurodevelopmental disorders, and identified genes involved in the brain development that are regulated by T3 (37). Results from human observational studies are intriguing to interpret, and further studies are needed to determine and support other viewpoints of causality e.g. strength, specificity and consistency (59).

An important aspect to consider is the plasticity of the developing brain (36). The susceptibility of later development of disease in children exposed in utero to maternal thyroid dysfunction is likely to interact with the postnatal environment (Fig. 1), and structural alterations induced during the fetal brain development may be recovered by brain plasticity provided that all factors in the postnatal environment are favorable.

Declaration of interest
The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest that could be perceived as prejudicing the impartiality of this review.

Funding
This research did not receive any specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial or not-for-profit sector.

Acknowledgements
The authors dedicate this review to Prof. Peter Laurberg who tragically passed away on June 20, 2016. Prof. Peter Laurberg had a long-lasting and intense interest in the field of thyroid disease and pregnancy, and he participated in the initial work with the present review and in the discussion of the concept of fetal programming by maternal thyroid dysfunction. His contributions were invaluable and will be greatly missed.

References
7 Willoughby KA, McAndrews MP & Rovet J. Effects of maternal hypothyroidism on offspring hippocampus and memory. Thyroid 2013 24 576–584. (doi:10.1089/thy.2013.0215)
15 Forsdahl A. Are poor living conditions in childhood and adolescence an important risk factor for arteriosclerotic heart disease? British Journal of Preventive and Social Medicine 1977 31 91–95.


Siddiqui S. Feverish prospects for seizure genetics. *Nature Genetics* 2014 **46** 1255–1256. (doi:10.1038/ng.3150)


Bernal J. Thyroid hormone receptors in brain development and function. *Nature Clinical Practice Endocrinology and Metabolism* 2007 **3** 249–259. (doi:10.1038/ncpendmet0424)


73 Andersen SL, Olsen J, Wu CS & Laurberg P. Low birth weight in children born to mothers with hyperthyroidism and high birth weight in hypothyroidism, whereas preterm birth is common in both conditions: a Danish National Hospital Register study. European Thyroid Journal 2013 2 135–144. (doi:10.1159/000350513)